Judge Dimitrios Raikos

Judge Deborah Thomas-Felix

Case No.: 2018-1146

Date: 29 June 2018

Registrar: Weicheng Lin

Counsel for Abu Malluh ta

Counsel for Commission

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

JUDGE MARTHA HALFELD, PRESIDING.

1. The United Nations Appeals Tribunal (Appeals Tribunal) has before it an appeal against Judgment No. UNRWA/DT/2017/041, rendered by the Dispute Tribunal of the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA DT or UNRWA Dispute Tribunal and UNRWA or Agency, respectively) on 29 November 2017, in the case of AbMbela v Observations.

The Commissioner-General filed the appeal on 31 January 2018,¹ and Mr. Ra'ed Abu Malluh, Mr. Ra'fat Shlash, Mr. Khaled ZamZam, and Mr. Ra'ad Hussein (Abu Malluh & ) filed their joint answer on 21 March 2018.

#### Facts and Procedure

2. The following facts are uncontested:<sup>2</sup>

### Applo Ma

- ... Applicant Ra'ed Abu Malluh began working for the Agency in 2000 as a daily [-]paid [employee] on an intermittent basis. On 5 December 2007, the Chief, Compensation & Management Services Division, Headquarters Amman ("CCMSD") sent to the Head, Area Staff Personnel Section, a Post Description ("PD") for the post of Messenger A, Grade 2. The Director of Human Resources ("DHR") signed the PD on 5 December 2007.
- ... On 2 June 2009, [Mr. Abu Malluh] signed the PD for Messenger A, Grade 2. In

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

A Letter of	of Appointment ('	"LoA") states th	nat the duration of	the fixed-term
appointment was	1 June 2009 to 31	1 May 2012, for	the post title Mess	senger Porter at
Grade 2, Step 1.	The LoA was s	signed by the	HRO on 1 June	2009 and by
[Mr. Abu Malluh]	on 2 June 2009.			

... On 20 May 2012, [Mr. Abu Malluh] was sent a letter by the HRO informing him that his fixed-term appointment was extended for another three years ending on

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

... A LoA shows that, effective 1 August 2004, [Mr. Hussein] was offered a fixed-term appointment as Messenger Porter, Grade 2, until 31 January 2005. The LoA, which [Mr. Hussein] signed on 2 August 2004, further informed [Mr. Hussein] that his appointment was changing from category Z to X.

... By letter dated 13 February 2005, a Personnel Officer informed [Mr. Hussein] of the following:

With reference to Travel & Transport Officer, [Headquarters (HQ)] (A) letter TTO/128/2005 dated 9 January 2005, I am pleased to inform you that it has been decided to extend your fixed[-]term appointment with the Agency for three years ending on 31.01.2008.

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

indicates the post title Messenger Porter, Level 1A, Step 2. In addition, on 7 May 2000, [Mr. Zamzam] signed an Area Staff PD for Messenger, Grade 2.

... By letter dated 17 March 2002, a Personnel Officer informed [Mr. Zamzam] that his appointment was extended for two years ending on 30 April 2004. This letter refers to the 13 April 2000 letter, and at the bottom of the letter appear the typed name of [Mr. Zamzam] and post title Messenger Porter underneath his name.

... By letter dated 11 May 2004, a Personnel Officer informed [Mr. Zamzam]:

With reference to Travel & Transport Officer, HQ (A) letter TTO/128/2004 dated 11 May 2004, I am pleased to inform you that it has been decided to extend your fixed[-]term appointment with the Agency for two years ending on 30 April 2006.

Please note that this extension will be with no change to the terms and conditions stipulated in the letter of appointment, which was signed by you on 07.05.2000.

[...].

[Mr. Zamzam] signed this letter on 12 May 2004, and at the bottom of the letter appear the typed name of th[Mr. Zamzam] and post title Messenger Porter underneath his name.

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

Λ.	-
Д	м
, ,	~

.. By letter dated 2 April 2008 from an Acting Personnel Officer, Applicant

 THE UNITED	NATIONS	APPEALS I R	IBUNAL	
			Judgment No. 201	8-UNAT-856

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

stress for lack of evidence, it awarded moral damages in the amount of USD 1,000 each for the "mishandling, including confusion in the post titles, contracts and renewal letters of [Abu Malluh & .], and conflicting information from the Agency".

#### Submissions

The Commissioner-General's Appeal

5. The Commissioner-General submits that the UNRWA DT erred on a question of law and fact resulting in a manifestly unreasonable decision when it awarded the allowances for extra duties and moral damages. Notwithstanding its unequivocal assertion that there was no legal

# THE UNITED NATIONS A

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

- 11. Finally, Abu Malluh  $\clubsuit$  . submit that the Commissioner-General "once again failed to meet time limitations" and that there was not sufficient reason for submitting the motion for extension of the time limit to file an appeal, considering, in particular, the strict approach to the observance of time limits by the Commissioner-General promulgated by the Appeals Tribunal in Db .12
- 12. Based on the foregoing, Mr. Abu Malluh 🖨 . request that the Appeals Tribunal dismiss the appeal.

#### Considerations

13. The issue under appeal is whether the UNRWA DT erred in law or fact resulting in a manifestly unreasonable decision when it awarded special allowances to Abu Malluh & a . for extra duties performed during the period of 14 April to 30 September 2014 and compensation for moral damages.

A

14. The UNRWA DT found that certain duties performed in this period were outside the scope of Abu Malluh & .'s contracts. The UNRWA DT relied on paragraph 4.1 of

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

17. The applicable law on this matter is as follows:

PD No. A/3/Rev.1/Part XI/Amend.5:

1. PURPOSE

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

- 19. This Tribunal will therefore first address the issue of whether the UNRWA DT exceeded its competence by substituting its own decision for that of the Commissioner-General in awarding the special allowance.
- 20. It is settled in our jurisprudence that the aforementioned provisions bestow discretionary powers on the Agency to pay the special allowances set forth in this instrument and that this discretion must be exercised reas

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

- 27. Second, as mentioned above, the UNRWA DT declined to award compensation for alleged psychological pressure or stress due to lack of evidence. However, it found that there was a fundamental breach of Abu Malluh & A.'s contracts resulting from mishandling, including confusion in titles of posts, contracts and renewal letters, and conflicting information from the Agency. The UNRWA DT awarded compensation for moral damages therefor.
- 28. In his appeal, the Commissioner-General does not challenge the proposition that a fundamental breach could in itself lead to an award of compensation for damages, as settled in our jurisprudence in Ab  $^{19}$ —partially superseded in Kb  $^{20}$  following the amendment of Article 10(5) of the UNDT Statute cited above. The jurisprudence applied in Kb , however, is not pertinent in the present case, since no such amendment has been

Judgment No. 2018-UNAT-856

irregularities"<sup>23</sup>, "reckless abuse of power"<sup>24</sup>, "deliberate manipulation of the Organization's processes", <sup>25</sup> or significant violations of pertinent provisions with regard to highly consequential decisions such as termination and transfer to other posts. The ultimately inconsequential "anomalies" found in the case at hand do not reach this level of severity. Considering that Article 10(7) of the UNRWA DT Statute prohibits awards of punitive damages, the focus should not be placed on th

. I	ud	a	m	e۱	nt
J	uu	У		CI	ш

		Judgment	
31.	The appeal is granted and J	udgment No. UNRWA/DT/	/2017/041 is vacated.
Origir	nal and Authoritative Version:	English	
Dated	this $29^{th}$ day of June 2018 in	New York, United States.	
	( <b>§</b> )	( <b>§</b>	( <b>§</b> )
Jı	udge Halfeld, Presiding	Judge Raikos	Judge Thomas-Felix
Enter	ed in the Register on this 10 <sup>th</sup>	day of August 2018 in New	York, United States.
	<b>(</b>		
V	Veicheng Lin, Registrar		