#### Introduction

1. Te A!!"#\$ant \$ontests te de\$#s#on to de\$"a%e #m #ne"#g#&"e fo% te Nat#ona" P%ofess#ona" 'ff#\$e% ()NP'\*+ !os#t#on at te N',- "e.e" #n te C#.#" Affa#%s /e\$t#on ()CA/\*+ of te Un#ted Nat#ons Pea\$e0ee!#ng 10%\$e #n C2!%us ()UN13C4P\*+5 ad.e%t#sed t %oug Jo& '!en#ng ()J'\*+ 6/2017 ()te Pos#t#on\*+5 and5 te efo%e5 to e8\$"ude #m f%om te %e\$%u#tment!%o\$ess.

## 2. -2 9a2 of %emed#es5 e %e:uests;

- a. <#s %eass#gnment to a !os#t#on #n a Un#ted Nat#ons off#\$e of #s \$ o#\$e (#n a fam#"2 dut2 stat#on+5 #n t e Phofess#ona" \$atego%2 and #n t e o\$\$u!at#ona" ghou!s of C#.#" Affa#hs5 Po"#t#\$a" Affa#hs oh 3nfohmat#on Ana"2st=
- &. 1#nan\$#a" \$om!ensat#on fo% mo%a" damages5 %e!utat#on and #nteg%#t2 damages5 as 9e"" as fo% t e )de"#&e%ate attem!t to !%e.ent > #s? \$a%ee% de.e"o!ment\*=
- \$. D#s\$#!"#na%2 a\$t#on aga#nst t ose %es!ons#&"e fo% a\$t#ons \$onst#tut#ng)m#s\$ondu\$t5 a&use of aut o%#t2 and m#smanagement\*.

### Preliminary Matters

7. T e @es!ondent ad.#sed t at a ea\#ng on t e me\#ts 9as not ne\\$essa\25 9 e\\*eas t e A!!"#\\$ant \%e:uested a ea\#ng. T e !a\\*t

5. At t e T%#&una"Cs %e:uest5 t e @es!ondent !%odu\$ed5 ex parte5 t e %e!o%t of an #n.est#gat#on \$ondu\$ted on a""eged #%%egu"a%#t#es #n t e %e\$%u#tment !%o\$ess fo% t e Pos#t#on. Afte% %e.#e9#ng #t5 t e T%#&una" \$on\$"uded t at #t \$onta#ned no add#t#ona" #nfo%mat#on %e"e.ant to t e matte%s unde% e8am#nat#on #n t e !%esent \$ase. 3n add#t#on5 t e #n.est#gat#on %e!o%t %e\$o%ds a \$onf#dent#a" #n.est#gat#on5 and no manage%#a" de\$#s#on as 2et &een ta0en &ased on #ts f#nd#ngs. 1o% t ese %easons5 t e %e!o%t 9as not s a%ed 9#t t e A!!"#\$ant and t e T%#&una" 9#"" not ta0e #t #nto a\$\$ount.

**Facts** 

E.

10. F%. C#&o%5 /en#o% Po"#t#\$a" Ad.#se%5 UN13C4P5 at t e %e"e.ant t#me5 9#t

15. F%. C#&o% test#f#ed t at #n %es!onse to t e a&o.e5 e to"d t e CCP' t at #n "#g t of t e g%eat #nte%est #n t e t9o!osts among "o\$a" staff5 #t 9ou"d &e a !#t2 not to g#.e an2 of t em a \$ an\$e to \$om!ete. <e t e%efo%e as0ed t e CCP' to a.e anot e% "oo0 at t e "#st to see #f at "east one G%ee0,C2!%#ot and one Tu%0#s , C2!%#ot "o\$a" staff mem&e% \$ou"d &e #n\$"uded5 and ment#oned t e A!!"#\$ant as one of t9o good #nte%na" \$and#dates. <e fu%t e% to"d t e T%#&una" t at e ad 9o%0ed 9#t t e A!!"#\$ant a g%eat dea"5 One9 e ad a un#.e%s#t2 deg%ee and t oug t e \$ou"d !e%fo%m 9e"" #n t e Pos#t#on. 1#na""25 e \$onf#%med not to a.e \$ e\$0ed t e A!!"#\$antCs P<P o% ana"2se #s 9o%0 e8!e%#en\$e aga#

20. 10""09#ng e% !%ede\$esso%Cs de!a%tu%e5 Fs. Gaddou%a too0 u! t e !ost of CCP' on 6 '\$to&e% 20175 &e\$om#ng %es!ons#&"e fo% t e <uman @esou%\$es Fanagement /e\$t#on #n t e F#ss#on. / e to"d t e T%#&una" t at on e% se\$ond da2 on dut25 t e <#%#ng Fanage% \$ame to see e% to e8!%ess e% \$on\$e%ns t at F%. C#&o% ad #nf"uen\$ed t e se"e\$t#on of e"#g#&"e \$and#dates fo% t e J'.

25. 3t a"so &e\$ame a!!a\text{\text{a}}ent to Fs. Gaddou\text{\text{a}}t t e J' ad m\text{\text{\text{m}}}stated t e 2ea\text{\text{s}}s of \text{\text{\text{\text{e}}}e.ant 90\text{\text{0}} e8!e\text{\text{\text{m}}}en\text{\text{\text{e}}}e \text{\text{\text{e}}}:u\text{\text{\text{m}}}ed fo\text{\text{v}} t e Pos\text{\text{\text{m}}}ton. T e Guidelines for Determination of Level and Step on Recruitment to the Professional Category and Above5 \text{\text{\text{m}}}ssued \text{\text{\text{e}}}2 t e 'ff\text{\text{\text{m}}}se of <uman @esou\text{\text{\text{s}}}se Fanagement ()'<\text{\text{\text{\text{m}}}}se +\text{\text{\text{m}}}se center fo\text{\text{m}} su\text{\text{m}} of !os\text{\text{\text{m}}}t\text{\text{m}}so. 3n Fs. Gaddou\text{\text{\text{m}}}alou\text{\text{\text{m}}}se 5 t \text{\text{\text{m}}}se \text{\text{\text{m}}}so t e A!!"\text{\text{\text{m}}}sant\text{\text{c}}se"\text{\text{\text{m}}}d\text{\text{m}}se center d\text{\text{m}} and \text{\text{m}}se center d\text{\text{m}}se center d\te

- 26. B #"e t e #nte%.#e9 !ane" 9as \$ons#de%#ng #ts de\$#s#on on t e Pos#t#on5 Fs. Gaddou%a ad.#sed #t t at t e A!!"#\$ant ad &een 9%ong"2 deemed e"#g#&"e fo% t e N-' !ost and s ou"d not &e \$ons#de%ed. F%. C#&o% to"d t e T%#&una" t at e 9as amaHed to ea% t #s. <e &e"#e.ed t at on t e !%ete8t of meet#ng st%#\$t %u"es and %egu"at#ons t e &est !e%son fo% t e Ao& ad not &een se"e\$ted. <e %a#sed #s o&Ae\$t#ons to t e C F /5 &ut d#d not \$ a""enge t e de\$#s#on and a G%ee0,C2!%#ot \$and#date 9 o #n #s .#e9 ad \$ome se\$ond 9as %e\$ommended.
- 2E. 'n 27 '\$to&e% 20175 t e A!!"#\$ant 9 as #nfo%med .#a ema#" t at #s name 9 ou"d &e %emo.ed f%om t e "#st of e"#g#&"e \$and#dates fo% t e Pos#t#onCs %e\$%u#tment !%o\$ess &e\$ause5 as a %esu"t of a m#sta0e made &2 t e Adm#n#st%at#on5 e ad &een #nad.e%tent"2 %u"ed as e"#g#&"e fo% t e Pos#t#on a"t oug e d#d not meet t e m#n#mum 9 o%0 e8!e%#en\$e %e:u#%ement as st#!u"ated #n t e J'.
- 26. 'n 24 and 25 '\$to&e% 20175 t e A!!"#\$ant and Fs. Gaddou%a e8\$ anged ema#"s a&out t e %easons fo% t e de\$#s#on. 'n 26 '\$to&e% 20175 at F%. C#&o%Cs %e:uest5 Fs. Gaddou%a met 9#t t e A!!"#\$ant #n t e !%esen\$e of t e CF/5 UN13C4P. At t at meet#ng s e %e#te%ated t at e% !%ede\$esso% 9as #n e%%o% to f#nd t e A!!"#\$ant e"#g#&"e.
- 29. Fs. Gaddouka noted t at t e A!!"#\$antCs 90%0 e8!ek#en\$e 9as most"2 as an 3T Ass#stant5 9 ekeas t e Pos#t#on 9as #n C#.#" Affa#ks. T e A!!"#\$ant \$"a#med t at e ad &een te\$ n#\$a""2 \$"eaked fo% !osts #n t e Phofess#ona" \$ategok2 on se.eka" o\$\$as#ons5 &ut Fs. Gaddouka stated t at t e te\$ n#\$a" \$"eakan\$e s2stem no "ongek" a!!"#ed and t at #s !ke.#ous \$"eakan\$e(s+

76. T e A!!"#\$ant ga.e e.#den\$e \$on\$e\n#ng #s s!e\$#f#\$ !\ofess#ona" e8!e\#en\$e t at e \&e"#e.es s ou"d a.e \&een ta0en #nto a\\$ount #n \\$a"\\$u"at\#ng #s \\ee"e.ant 90\\0000 e8!e\#en\$e fo\\0000 t e Pos\#t\#on.

 \$. D#d t e A!!"#\$ant a.e a "eg#t#mate e8!e\$tat#on to !a%t#\$#!ate #n t e \$om!et#t#.e se"e\$t#on e8e%\$#seL

### Parties' submissions

- 41. T e A!!"#\$antCs !\\#n\\$#!a" \\$ontent\#ons a\\e;

  - &. <e o''ds &ot a -a\$ e''o\( Cs \) and a Faste\( Cs \) deg\( ee5 \) and o .e\( f#.e 2ea\( Ss \) of \( \cdot e = ant \) e8!e\( \cdot e = b = ant \) = \$\$ #s mo\( \cdot e = ant \) mo\( e = ant =
    - #. /e!tem&e% 1996 to Fa2 1996; fu"",t#me em!"o2ment as a P%og%amme Asso\$#ate fo% a Non,Go.e%nmenta" ' %gan#Hat#on=
    - ##. June 1996 to June 1999; fu"",t#me em!"o2ment as a @esea%\$

      Asso\$#ate=
    - ###. Ju"2 to De\$em&e% 1999; fu"",t#me em!"o2ment as a P%ess Atta\$ K Asso\$#ate5 C2!%us Dm&ass2 #n B as #ngton D.C.=
    - #... Janua%2 to June 2000; fu"",t#me em!"o2ment as a @esea%\$

- \$. A\$\$o\d#ng to t e Manual for the Applicant on the Staff Selection System ( nspira+5 s#n\$e August 20115 e8!e\#en\$e a\$:u#\ed at t e G/,6 "e.e" and a&o.e #s \$ons\#de\ed as !\ofess\#ona\" e8!e\#en\$e. 3n 20065 e \overline{\text{we}\$e}\#.ed te\$ n\#\\$a\" \\$"ea\\an\\$e fo\\ se.e\\an\" P,2 !osts and se\\.ed \#n UN313J as a C\#.\#\" Affa\#\s 'ff\#\\$e\\ at t e P,2 "e.e\". T e Af\\#\\$an Un\#on,Un\#ted Nat\#ons F\#ss\#on \#n Da\\fu\hat\ and UNF3J found t at e met t e e\"\#\#\#\#\#\#\#\$ \$\overline{\text{wfte}\#\#} fo\\ C\#.\#\" Affa\#\s !osts and s\#m\#\"a\\ o\\$\\under\!a\#ona\" g\\ou!\s \#n t e P\\ofess\#ona\" \\$atego\\2=
- d. T e Adm#n#st%at#on ne.e% !%o.#ded an2 e8!"anat#ons o% %u"es go.e%n#ng t e e"#g#&#"#t2 fo% Nat#ona" P%ofess#ona" 'ff#\$e%s !osts. T e \$and#datesC e"#g#&#"#t2 s\$%een#ng #s a !%o\$ess su&Ae\$t to #nte%!%etat#on and a""o9#ng a \$e%ta#n f"e8#&#"#t2. '.e% t e 2ea%s5 e as5 su\$\$ess#.e"2 and \$ont%ad#\$to%#"25 &een found e"#g#&"e and #ne"#g#&"e fo% d#ffe%ent !osts %e:u#%#ng essent#a""2 t e same e8!e%#en\$e5 9 #\$ \$annot &ut se%#ous"2 unde%m#ne #s t%ust #n t e fa#%ness and \$ons#sten\$2 of t e Adm#n#st%at#onCs assessment=
- e. T e memo%andum of t e Ass#stant /e\$%eta%2,Gene%a" fo% <uman @esou%\$es Fanagement ent#t"ed Recent changes in the staffing procedures #nd#\$ates t at e8!e%#en\$e at t e G,6 "e.e" s ou"d a.e &een \$ounted as %e"e.ant !%ofess#ona" e8!e%#en\$e. T e e8!e%#en\$e e a\$:u#%ed !%#o% to \$om!"et#on of #s a\$adem#\$ deg%ees s ou"d a"so a.e &een \$ounted as !%ofess#ona" e8!e%#en\$e. 'n"2 50M of t e A!!"#\$antCs 9 o%O#ng e8!e%#en\$e as a @esea%\$ Asso\$#ate 9 as \$ounted I des!#te &e#ng \$"ea%"2 stated as a fu"",t#me em!"o2ment I 9#t out g#.#ng a %eason o% a "ega" &as#s fo% #t=
- f. At the meet#ng of 26 '\$to&e% 20175 Fs. Gaddou%a suggested the A!!"#\$antCs "ate%a" mole to CA/. A\$\$o\d#ng to the %u"es5 the m#n#mum 90\0#ng e8!e\#en\\$e \%e:\u#\ements fo\% G,6 !osts #s selen 2ea\%s. Fs. Gaddou\%a \\$ons\#de\ed the A!!"#\\$ant to &e e"\#g\#\&"e5 9 e\eas she d\#s:\ua"\#f\#ed #m fo\% the N', !ost &e\\$ause5 a\\$\o\d#ng to e\%5 end d\text{not lossess the m#n#mum 90\0#ng \%e:\u#\ement of the 90 2ea\%s=

- g. T e%e #s no su\$ t #ng as &o%de%"#ne e"#g#&#"#t2. 1%om t e moment t e A!!"#\$ant 9 as found e"#g#&"e and !a%t#\$#!ated #n t e ent#%e !%o\$ess5 d#s:ua"#f2#ng #m afte% t e \$om!"et#on of t e !%o\$ess #s un"a9fu"=
  - . Des!#te t e d#s\$%e!an\$#es and e%%o%s !u%!o%ted"2 found #n t e

&.

- f. T e A!!"#\$ant 9 as g#.en \$\( \) ed#t fo\( \) a"f of \( \) #s e8!e\( \)#en\( \) e as an \( \) nte\( \) n B as \( \) and D.C. As an \( \)#nte\( \) ns \( \) sons\( \)#de\( \) ed to \( \) e a "ea\( \) nte\( \) ng e8!e\( \)#en\( \) e 8!e\( \)#en\( \) e 3 \( \) esea\( \) Ass\( \)#stant 9 as \( \)\$ soo of a \( \) e 9 \( \)#ten \( \) e 9 \( \)#ten \( \)#ten
- g. T e e8!e%#en\$e #n t e '%gan#Hat#on #n t e f#e"d of 3T afte% \$om!"et#ng #s Faste%Cs deg%ee 9as not \$ounted5 as #t 9as not %e"e.ant fo% C#.#" Affa#%s.

  B #"e e8!e%#en\$e a\$:u#%ed #n !os#t#ons #n t e G/ \$atego%2 at t e G/,6 "e.e" and a&o.e ma2 &e \$ounted as !%ofess#ona" e8!e%#en\$e5 #t must &e #n t e f#e"ds #dent#f#ed #n t e J'=
- T e A!!"#\$antCs tota" %e"e.ant 90%0 e8!e%#en\$e a\$:u#%ed afte% #s -a\$ e"o%Cs deg%ee 9 as 14 and a a"f mont s5 and t at a\$:u#%ed afte% #s Faste%Cs deg%ee 9 as t %ee mont s. D.en #f #s e8!e%#en\$e as an 3nte%n and @esea%\$ Asso\$#ate 9e%e \$ounted #n fu""5 e 9ou"d st#"" not meet t e m#n#mum %e:u#%ed=
- A. T e CCP' of t e F#ss#on 9 as %es!ons#&"e fo% t e s\$%een#ng!%o\$ess to dete%m#ne #f \$and#dates met t e m#n#mum edu\$at#on and e8!e%#en\$e %e:u#%ements=

- O. T e \$#%\$umstan\$es of t e A!!"#\$antCs #nte%.#e9 a%e #%%e"e.ant fo% t e !u%!ose of t #s \$ase. <e \$an a.e no e8!e\$tat#on of &e#ng \$ons#de%ed 9 en e d#d not meet one of t e %e:u#%ed \$%#te%#a=
- ". <a.#ng made a m#n#ma" s o 9 #ng t at t e A!!"#\$antCs \$and#datu%e 9 as g#.en fu"" and fa#% \$ons#de%at#on5 t e !%esum!t#on of %egu"a%#t2 a!!"#es. T e A!!"#\$ant as not d#s\$ a%ged #s &u%den of !%o.#ng t %oug \$"ea% and \$on.#n\$#ng e.#den\$e t at t e \$ontested de\$#s#on #s un"a 9 fu". T e A!!"#\$ant d#d not d#s\$ a%ge #s &u%den of demonst%at#ng t at t e \$a"\$u"at#on of #s !%ofess#ona" e8!e%#en\$e 9 as f"a 9 ed.
- m. <#s te\$ n#\$a" \$"ea%an\$e of P,2 C#.#" Affa#%s 'ff#\$e% !os#t#ons #n 2006 does not esta&"#s t at e me69.7604(C) - 48(%)2.58852(e) ] TJD2022.66653(628772() - 80.41

## Consideration

ssue #\$ %ere the rules follo&ed correctly to assess relevant professional experience of the Applicant for the advertised '"(

- 47. T e "ega" f%ame 9 o%0 fo% t e se"e\$t#on of NP' !osts #s !%#ma%#"2 \$onta#ned #n t e Femo%andum of t e t en Unde%,/e\$%eta%2,Gene%a"5 De!a%tment of 1#e"d /u!!o%t5 ent#t"ed Delegation of Recruitment Authority and Responsibility for !ational Professional "fficers5 dated 17' \$to&e% 2006 ()2006 Femo%andum\*+.
- 44. A"t oug Adm#n#st%at#.e 3nst%u\$t#on /T/A3/2010/7 (/taff /e"e\$t#on /2stem+5 9 #\$ a!!"#es to #nte%nat#ona" staff %e\$%u#tment5 e8!%ess"2 e8\$"udes (#n se\$. 7.2(#++ t e %e\$%u#tment !%o\$edu%es fo% NP ' !osts #n !ea\$e0ee!#ng o!e%at#ons and s!e\$#a" !o"#t#\$a" m#ss#ons f%om #ts s\$o!e5 t e 2006 Femo%andum

4E.

51. As t e ead of t e off#\$e5 Fs. Gaddou%a 9as .ested 9#t t e aut o%#t2 to assess t e e"#g#&#"#t2 of \$and#dates fo% t e Pos#t#on. As t e off#\$#a" %es!ons#&"e fo% ensu%#ng t e #nteg%#t2 of an2 %e\$%u#tment !%o\$ess #n t e F#ss#on5 s e ad not on"2 t e !o9e% &ut a"so t e dut2 to .e%#f2 t at t e \$and#datesC e"#g#&#"#t2 ad &een \$o%%e\$t"2 dete%m#ned.

52. T e fa\$t t at t e !\(\mathbb{e}\),\$\(\mathbb{e}\) en#ng ! ase of t e !\(\mathbb{e}\) o\$\(\mathbb{e}\) du\(\mathbb{e}\) 9 as \$\(\mathbb{e}\) ondu\(\mathbb{e}\) te CCP' fun\(\mathbb{e}\) the not !\(\mathbb{e}\). ent e\(\mathbb{e}\) f\(\mathbb{e}\) fun\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) ondu\(\mathbb{e}\) ondu\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) ondu\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) ondu\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) ondu\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathbb{e}\) e \$\(\mathb

T e Manual for the Recruiter on the Staff Selection System

60. <09e.e% as !%e.#ous"2 ment#oned5 t #s ema#" 9as #ssued on 2E 1e&%ua%2 2014 and 9as not a!!"#\$a&"e at t e t#me of t e \$ontested de\$#s#on. D.en assum#ng #t 9as5 t e T%#&una" #s not \$on.#n\$ed t at #t s ou"d &e %ead as !%es\$%#&#ng

65. 3n .#e9 of a"" t e a&o.e5 t e T%#&una" \$on\$"udes t at t e %u"es 9 e%e \$o%%e\$t"2

- 66. 'n t e &as#s of t #s "#st5 t e A!!"#\$ant \$"a#ms mo%e t an f#.e 2ea%s of %e"e.ant !%ofess#ona" e8!e%#en\$e5 9 #"e Fs. Gaddou%aCs \$a"\$u"at#on %esu"ted #n a tota" of 14.5 mont s afte% #s -a\$ e"o%Cs and t %ee mont s afte% #s Faste%Cs deg%ee. T e d#ffe%en\$e &et9een t e t9o \$a"\$u"at#ons a%#se &e\$ause t e Adm#n#st%at#on;
  - a. D#d not \$ount e8!e%#en\$e !%e.#ous to t e \$om!"et#on of t e A!!"#\$antCs -a\$ e"o% (#.e.5 90%0 as P%og%amme Asso\$#ate fo% an NG' &et9een /e!tem&e% 1996 and Fa2 1996+=
  - &. C\( ed\)#ted t e A!!"\( \)#\( ant 9\)#t 50M of \( \)#s 90\( 0 \) as \( \)@esea\( \) Asso\( \)#ate and as 3nte\( n \) P\( \) P\( \) ss Atta\( \) K=
  - \$. D#d not \$ount an2 e8!e%#en\$e fo% t e A!!"#\$antCs !e%fo%man\$e of C#.#" Affa#%s,%e"ated tas0s #n !a%a""e" to #s off#\$#a" dut#es as 3T Ass#stant #n UNF3J and UN13C4P.
- E0. As to t e se\$ond %eason5 Fs. Gaddou%a e8!"a#ned #n e% test#mon2 t at s e %edu\$ed &2 a"f t e t#me t e A!!"#\$ant 90%0ed as a @esea%\$ Asso\$#ate &e\$ause t #s e8!e%#en\$e 9as of an a\$adem#\$ natu%e and5 a\$\$o%d#ng to t e A!!"#\$antCs o9n P<P5 e 9as at t e same t#me stud2#ng fu"",t#me.

E2. Jast"25 as \$on\$e\ns t e t #\ld \( \text{\text{eason}} \) #t #s not se"

62. T e t#me ga! &et9een t e not#f#\$at#on to t e A!!"#\$ant of #s %emo.a" f%om t e !%o\$ess and t e not#f#\$at#on of ana"ogous de\$#s#ons to ot e% \$and#dates does

92. Cranfield 2017,UNAT,76E 0 son0 a sase 9 elle a staff mem&ell 9 as

# Conclusion

96. 3n .#e9 of t e fo%ego#ng5 t e T%#&una" DDC3DD/;

T e a!!"#\$at#on #s %eAe\$ted.

(Signed+

Judge Co%a" / a9

Dated t #s 2E