Introduction

- 1. This is an a!!" #at on fo\$ \$e% is on of &udgment UNDT/2011/10' ()the Judgment*+. ,n the Judgment- the D is! ute T\$. una" ()the T\$. una"*+ de# ded that the de# is on to \$e/u \$e the A!!" #ant to \$e%e\$t to his init a" P03 !ost had not .een the su.&e#t of a management e%a"uat on and 1 as not \$e#e %a."e .2 the T\$. una".1
- 2. The .

,n essen#e- 2ou #ontended that 2ou 1 e\$e not !\$o\$ ded 1 th the \$easons fo\$ the de# s on to #an#e# 2ou \$eass gnment to the A.u Dha. ;u.07eg ona# : ff #e and that the de# s on 1 as ta nted .2

Parties' submissions

- 1D. The A!!" #ant su.m ts that=
 - a. The 45U d d not \$e% e1 the ent \$et2 of the ema" of 1h #h he \$e/uested e%a"uat on and)s3!!ed* h s \$e/uest fo\$ management e%a"uat on of the de# s on not to)demote* h m f\$om P09 to P03 1h #h 1 as !a\$t of the #ontested de# s on>
 - The 7es!ondent fa"se"2 test f ed and den ed .efo\$e the T\$.una" that a \$e/uest had ne%e\$.een made to \$e% e1 the de# s on to)demote* h m>
 - #. 6e offe\$ed to \$ead the memo of 9 De#em.e\$ 2009 at the T\$.una"Bs hea\$ ng. 6e a""eges that o!!o\$tun t2 1 as den ed .2 the T\$.una">
 - d. The fa#t that the de# s on #on#e\$n ng the)demot on* 1 as deemed not to ha%e .een \$e#e %a."e .e#ause the A!!" #ant d d not \$e/uest management e%a"uat on- s a #"ea\$ nd #at on that the T\$.una" 1 as not a 1 a\$e of the fa#t that he had made the \$e/uest>
 - e. ,n !"ead ngs made .2 the 7es!ondent n su.se/uent #ases .\$ought .2 h m- the 7es!ondent a##e!ted that he had sought management e%a"uat on fo\$ the \$e/u \$ement fo\$ h m to \$etu\$n to h s o\$ g na" P03 !ost. 6e a""eged that n h s \$e!"2 of 29 ?e.\$ua\$2 2012- the 7es!ondent adm tted- fo\$ the f \$st t methat the memo of 9 De#em.e\$ 2009 1 th \$es!e#t to 1h #h a \$e/uest fo\$ \$e% e 1 had .een made- had a"so n#"uded the ssue of h s demot on> and
 - f. ,n h s 7e!"2 of 12 June 2013 the 7es!ondent #on#eded to the A!!" #antBs #ontent on that the 45U had not !\so!e\s"2 \se% e1ed a"" the de# s ons .efo\se t n ts management e\sa"uat on dated 3 ?e.\sua\s2 2010.
- 19. The 7es!ondent su.m tted that the A!!" #ant has not met the #ond t ons fo\$
 \$e% s on of &udgment .e#ause=
 - a. The a""eged)ne1"2 d s#o%e\$ed fa#t* 1 as 3no1n to the A!!" #ant and the T\$. una" at the t me the Judgment 1 as \$ende\$ed. The A!!" #ant shou"d

ha%e ment oned to the T\$.una" that 45U had o%e\$"oo3ed an ssue n h s \$e/uest fo\$ management e%a"uat on>

- The a""egat ons that the 7es!ondent ga%e)fa"se test mon2* on the fa#t that he had not \$e/uested management e%a"uat on a\$e unsu.stant ated>
- #. The 7es!ondentBs \$e!"2 of 29 ?e.\$ua\$2 2012 and 12 June 2013 #annot .e #ons de\$ed as ne1"2 d s#o%e\$ed fa#ts> the #ontents of the su.m ss ons of 29 ?e.\$ua\$2 2012 ha%e .een 3no1n to the A!!" #ant fo\$ o%e\$ a 2ea\$. The 12 June 2013 su.m ss on s a summa\$2 of the A!!" #antBs se%e\$a" \$e/uests of management e%a"uat on hen#e .ea\$s no e% den#e of ne1 fa#t>
- d. The A!!" #antBs \$etu\$n to h s P03 !ost- to 1 h #h he \$efe\$s to as a)demot on* n the 9 De#em.e\$ 2009 ema "- 1 as a me\$e \$e te\$at on of the A!!" #antBs te\$ms of #ont\$a#t of 21 4 a2 2007> as su#h t 1 as a #onf \$mat on of an ea\$" e\$ de# s on and not a ne1 de# s on> and
- e. The A!!" #antBs a!!" #at on s f\$ %o"ous and s an a.use of !\$o#ess that \$e/u \$es an a1a\$d of #osts.

Considerations

20. A\$t #"e 12.1 of the statute- 1 h #h s e#hoed n a\$t 29.1 and 29.2 of the T\$.una"Bs \$u"es of !\$o#edu\$e- !\$o% des that=

5 the\$!a\$t2 ma2 a!!"2 to the D s!ute T\$.una" fo\$ a \$e% s on of an eAe#uta."e &udgment on the .as s of the d s#o%e\$2 of a de# s %e fa#t 1 h #h 1 as- at the t me the &udgment 1 as \$ende\$ed- un3no 1 n to the D s!ute T\$.una" and to the !a\$t2 a!!"2 ng fo\$ \$e% s on- a"1a2s !\$o% ded that su#h gno\$an#e 1 as not due to neg" gen#e. The a!!" #at on must .e made 1 th n 30 #a"enda\$ da2s of the d s#o%e\$2 of the fa#t and 1 th n one 2ea\$ of the date of the &udgment.

21. Pu\$suant to a\$t. 11.3 of the statute of the T\$.una"- the &udgments of the D s!ute T\$.una")sha"" .e eAe#uta."e fo""o1 ng the eA! \$2 of the t me !\$0% ded fo\$ a!!ea" n the statute of the A!!ea"s T\$.una"*. ,n th s #ase- the t me fo\$ a!!ea"

of the Judgment eA! \$ed on 21 August 2011 fo""o1 ng 1h #h the &udgment .e#ame eAe#uta."e. The A!!" #antBs a!!ea" to UNAT 1 as hea\$d and d s!osed of on 29 June 2012. The Judgment 1 as the\$efo\$e te#hn #a""2 eAe#uta."e n te\$ms of the ; tatute at the t me th s a!!" #at on 1 as f "ed.

22. The de# s %e fa#t \$e" ed on .2 the A!!" #ant n h s a!!" #at on fo\$ \$e% s on 1 as that the ssue of the \$etu\$n of the A!!" #ant to h s n t a" P03 !os t on had .een the su .&e#t of a \$e/uest fo\$ management e%a"uat on.

23.

- 27. The A!!" #antBs "a#3 of a1a\$eness of the m!o\$tan#e of the need fo\$ the de# s %e fa#t to ha%e .een #"ea\$"2 addu#ed at the hea\$ ng #an on"2 .e att\$.uted to h s neg" gen#e o\$ that of h s #ounse" ad% s ng h m th\$oughout the !\$o#eed ngs. Ne the\$ the A!!" #ant no\$ h s #ounse" \$a sed the ssue 1 th the T\$.una" du\$ ng the hea\$ ng o\$ n su.se/uent su.m ss ons to the T\$.una" o\$ to UNAT.
- 2D. ,n 20130UNAT0320- the A!!ea"s T\$.una" d sm ssed an a!!" #at on fo\$ \$e% s on stat ng that)an a!!" #at on fo\$ \$e% s on of &udgment s on"2 \$e#e %a."e

31. Kh "e the A!!" #ant ma2 ha%e an a\$gument 1 th \$es!e#t to a de# s %e fa#th s a!!" #at on does not meet the othe\$ \$e/u \$ements n a\$t. 12.1 of the T\$.una"Bs statute.

Costs

32. A\$t #"e 10.< of the T\$.una"Bs statute em!o1e\$s the T\$.una" to a1a\$d #osts aga nst a !a\$t2 1he\$e t)dete\$m nes that a !a\$t2 has man fest"2 a.used the !\$o#eed ngs .efo\$e t*. ,n th s #ase- the A!!" #ant .\$ought a .ase"ess a!!" #at on fo\$ \$e% s on 1e"" outs de the t me " m ts fo\$ do ng so and afte\$ Ut(-0%)5 4 7 6-90(s)-"the